



# MARINE MAMMAL COMMISSION

24 January 2017

Ms. Jolie Harrison, Chief  
Permits and Conservation Division  
Office of Protected Resources  
National Marine Fisheries Service  
1315 East-West Highway  
Silver Spring, MD 20910-3225

Dear Ms. Harrison:

The Marine Mammal Commission (the Commission), in consultation with its Committee of Scientific Advisors on Marine Mammals, has reviewed the July 2015 application from the Texas Parks and Wildlife Department (TPWD) requesting that the National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) promulgate regulations under section 101(a)(5)(A) of the Marine Mammal Protection Act (the MMPA) to authorize the taking of bottlenose dolphins incidental to fishery monitoring activities in Texas waters. The Commission also has reviewed the NMFS's 6 January 2017 notice (82 Fed. Reg. 1721) announcing receipt of the application.

TPWD plans to monitor various finfish species to assess their relative abundance and size in various bays throughout coastal Texas waters. TPWD would deploy up to 780 gill nets per year, with 390 deployed in spring and 390 in fall<sup>1</sup>. Gill nets would be set only at night. TPWD is seeking authority to take by entanglement, and possible mortality, up to one bottlenose dolphin per year. Bottlenose dolphins could be taken from any bay, sound, or estuarine (BSE) stock from Laguna Madre to Sabine Lake.

NMFS determined the application received from TPWD on 29 July 2015 to be "adequate and complete" (82 Fed. Reg. 1722), yet it is unclear why NMFS delayed publication of a notice of receipt for nearly 18 months. In any case, the Commission disagrees with NMFS's assessment that the application is either adequate or complete. The application fails to provide the information necessary for NMFS to make the basic determinations under section 101(a)(5)(A) of the MMPA, that the taking will involve only small numbers of marine mammals and have a negligible impact on the affected marine mammal species or stocks. The application is scant on details. For example, the requirements under 50 C.F.R. § 216.104 are only briefly addressed including the sections involving the species and number of marine mammals likely to be in the area and the type of incidental take authorization being requested.

Although the application provides a short discussion of the number of marine mammals that could be taken incidental to the proposed fishery monitoring activities, it provides no discussion of the MMPA's small numbers determination or why it believes that that determination would be met. While the taking of a single animal each year may appear to be a small number, the guidance

---

<sup>1</sup> During two 10-week periods starting in mid-April and -September.

provided by NMFS has indicated that the small numbers determination is to be viewed in the context of the size of the affected population(s). The application notes that seven different stocks of bottlenose dolphins could be affected by its activities. Those stocks range in size from 152 animals for the Galveston Bay/East Bay/Trinity Bay stock to a low of 0-2 for the Sabine Lake stock. If one of the animals taken during the proposed five-year authorization were from the Sabine Lake population, it could remove 50 percent or even the entire population and therefore would not be considered a small number under NMFS's interpretation of the small-numbers determination.

Similarly, the application provides virtually no analysis as to why TPWD believes the negligible impact determination would be satisfied. The application indicated that if a dolphin is taken during the next five years, it will probably come from the Copano Bay/Aransas Bay/San Antonio Bay/Redfish Bay/Espiritu Santo Bay (Copano) stock. It then notes that “[s]ince the status of this stock is unknown, or undetermined, it is difficult to determine what impact this take will have and would depend on the sex of the dolphin taken.” Incongruously, and without any further discussion, the application then concludes that “[O]verall, we believe the impact of our activity to be negligible for all seven bay, sound, and estuary stocks found in Texas.” Looking again at the worst-case scenario of removing one or more dolphins from the Sabine Bay stock, there is no scientific basis to conclude that the taking would have a negligible impact on the population. Even for the Copano stock, which numbers 55 animals ( $N_{Best}$ ) and from which taking is considered most likely, the mortality of a single animal would not meet a negligible impact determination.

The application also is inadequate in other respects. It provides little information on mitigation measures. Rather, the application specifies only TPWD's current operating protocol, with the apparent assumption that the manner in which fishery monitoring activities are currently conducted will suffice. However, even if the MMPA's small numbers and negligible impact determinations are met, section 101(a)(5)(A)(i)(II)(aa) requires more—an authorization is to include “means of effecting the least practicable adverse impact on such species or stocks and its habitat....” TPWD's application at a minimum should discuss the measures developed by the bottlenose dolphin take reduction team, including mesh size limitations, time-area closures, net tending, and restrictions on night fishing.

It is incumbent on NMFS, as the regulatory agency, to ensure that the applications provided to the public for comment are adequate and complete prior to publication. And, if an application is inadequate or incomplete, it should be returned to TPWD for revision prior to publication. If TPWD chooses not to revise the application, then NMFS should deny the authorization request. For the reasons discussed herein, the Commission believes TPWD's application is inadequate and incomplete and therefore recommends that NMFS return the current application to TPWD for revision. The Commission further recommends that, if TPWD chooses not to revise the application or fails to submit an adequately revised application, NMFS decline to proceed with publication of proposed incidental take regulations. NMFS has published several fishery-related incidental take applications in recent years, including one for the Southeast Fisheries Science Center. TPWD should be advised to refer to those applications as a guide for ensuring that its revised application is adequate and complete.

Ms. Jolie Harrison  
24 January 2017  
Page 3

Please contact me if you have questions regarding the Commission's comments and recommendations.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Rebecca J. Lent". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "R" and a distinct "Lent" at the end.

Rebecca J. Lent, Ph.D.  
Executive Director

OFFICERS

Mark W. Ray, *Chairman of the Board*  
John Carlson, *President*  
Bruce Arendale, *Vice President*  
Doug Boyd, *Vice President*  
Mitch Brownlee, *Vice President*  
Venable Proctor, *Vice President*  
West Warren, *Secretary*  
Randy Poelma, *Treasurer*

EXECUTIVE BOARD

DeGraaf Adams  
Dan Appling  
John Arnim  
Brenda Ballard  
Chris Bean  
Ian Beliveaux  
Thomas Bell  
Reece Boudreaux  
Doak Brown  
Bob Brumby  
Rocky Chase  
Spencer Collins  
Josh Cook  
Dale Couch  
Patrick Cowles  
Brett Crawford  
Daniel Croft  
Phil Curran  
Bill Daugherty  
Mack Davis  
Mac DeLaup  
Ruben Delgadillo  
Robert DiCiccio  
Davis Dixon  
Richie Domei  
Bill Dunn  
Bob Eastland  
Tim Fading  
Phillip Fitzgerald  
Jay Gardner  
John Graham  
Charles Graml  
J.M. Green  
Donald Hall  
John Hansen  
Kyle Harris  
Jake Herring  
Liz Hewitt  
Robert Hickman  
Tom Hollingshead  
John Holmgreen  
Jackson Hooper  
Fred Howard  
Claude Jennings  
Dan Johnson  
Everett Johnson  
Ryan Joyce  
Buford Jurica  
Shane Justus  
William Kelsey  
Neal Kieschnik  
Joe Koshkin  
Gary Kuecker  
Josh Lack  
Kirk Laguarda  
Michael Laskowski  
Butch Long  
Ronald Luster, Sr.  
Ronald Luster, Jr.  
Doug Macha  
Gerald Mack  
Brad Marsh  
Steve Mashman  
Howard Mason  
Jack Mayfield  
Craig McDonold  
Scott McGuire  
Neal Meinzer  
John Merck  
Cris Meyer  
Ricky Meyer  
Danny Middlebrooks  
Bill Moore  
Burt Moritz  
Will Ohmstede  
Statira Overstreet  
Dexter Peacock  
Don Perkins  
Michael Petit  
Stoney Petit  
Mike Prasek, Jr.  
Richard Pratt  
Todd Radke  
Carl Ray  
Johnny Rayburg  
Mike Reed  
Bart Reese  
John Roberts  
Rick Roberts  
Scott Sanderson  
Kansas Sartin  
David Schorlemer  
Mike Sharp  
David Singleton  
Chris Smisek  
Larry Stanley  
Frank Still  
Tim Strickland  
Bill Strieber  
R. Corey Survant  
Ryan Therrell  
Norman Trubee  
Peter Turnbull  
Ben Vaughan  
Forrest Vollentine  
Troy Williamson  
Barry Young

Executive Director, *Robby Byers*



CONSERVATION & PROTECTION OF MARINE LIFE

6919 Portwest Drive, Suite 100 | Houston, Texas 77024  
p 713.626.4222 | f 713.961.3801 | CCATexas.org

February 2, 2017

Ms. Jolie Harrison  
Chief, Permits and Conservation Division  
Office of Protected Resources  
National Marine Fisheries Service  
1315 East-West Highway  
Silver Springs, Maryland 20910  
[ITP.Laws@noaa.gov](mailto:ITP.Laws@noaa.gov)

Re: RIN 0648–XF107

Dear Ms. Harrison,

The Texas Chapter of the Coastal Conservation Association (CCA Texas) submits the following comments on the Texas Parks and Wildlife (TPWD) request for authorization to take marine mammals incidental to conducting fishery-independent monitoring activities in estuarine waters of Texas.

CCA Texas is a non-profit marine conservation organization comprised of over 70,000 recreational anglers and coastal outdoor enthusiasts. Our mission is to conserve, promote and enhance the present and future availability of coastal natural resources for the benefit and enjoyment of the general public. In doing so, we work closely with TPWD to establish beneficial habitat, support internship opportunities, fund fisheries research and ensure the best data collection methods and science are available to fishery managers.

The TPWD Coastal Fisheries Division utilizes a suite of fishery-independent and fishery dependent assessments to scientifically characterize the status of commercially and recreationally important species. Each type of assessment is designed to give coast wide estimates for target species. These assessments provide trend data on the current status of commercially and recreationally important species and are a factor in establishing fishery regulations. Furthermore, a variety of interstate collaborations, grants, and applied research efforts are dependent upon data collected from these fisheries-independent monitoring activities.

TPWD's gills nets are 600 feet long and 4 feet deep with separate 150 foot sections of 3 and 4 inch (#12 monofilament), 5 and 6 inch (#18 monofilament) stretched mesh tied together in ascending mesh size. TPWD staff set the nets perpendicular to the shoreline one hour before sunset and retrieve them within four hours after the following sunrise. On rare

OFFICERS

Mark W. Ray, *Chairman of the Board*  
John Carlson, *President*  
Bruce Arendale, *Vice President*  
Doug Boyd, *Vice President*  
Mitch Brownlee, *Vice President*  
Venable Proctor, *Vice President*  
West Warren, *Secretary*  
Randy Poelma, *Treasurer*

EXECUTIVE BOARD

DeGraaf Adams  
Dan Appling  
John Arnim  
Brenda Ballard  
Chris Bean  
Ian Beliveaux  
Thomas Bell  
Reece Boudreaux  
Doak Brown  
Bob Brumby  
Rocky Chase  
Spencer Collins  
Josh Cook  
Dale Couch  
Patrick Cowles  
Brett Crawford  
Daniel Croft  
Phil Curran  
Bill Daugherty  
Mack Davis  
Mac DeLaup  
Ruben Delgadillo  
Robert DiCicco  
Davis Dixon  
Richie Domel  
Bill Dunn  
Bob Eastland  
Tim Fading  
Phillip Fitzgerald  
Jay Gardner  
John Graham  
Charles Graml  
J.M. Green  
Donald Hall  
John Hansen  
Kyle Harris  
Jake Herring  
Liz Hewitt  
Robert Hickman  
Tom Hollingshead  
John Holmgreen  
Jackson Hooper  
Fred Howard  
Claude Jennings  
Dan Johnson  
Everett Johnson  
Ryan Joyce  
Buford Jurica  
Shane Justus  
William Kelsey  
Neal Kieschnik  
Joe Koshkin  
Gary Kuecker  
Josh Lack  
Kirk Laguarda  
Michael Laskowski  
Butch Long  
Ronald Luster, Sr.  
Ronald Luster, Jr.  
Doug Macha  
Gerald Mack  
Brad Marsh  
Sieve Mashman  
Howard Mason  
Jack Mayfield  
Craig McDonnold  
Scott McGuire  
Neal Meinzer  
John Merck  
Cris Meyer  
Ricky Meyer  
Danny Middlebrooks  
Bill Moore  
Burt Moritz  
Will Ohmstede  
Statira Overstreet  
Dexter Peacock  
Don Perkins  
Michael Petit  
Stoney Petit  
Mike Prasek, Jr.  
Richard Pratt  
Todd Radke  
Carl Ray  
Johnny Rayburg  
Mike Reed  
Bart Reese  
John Roberts  
Rick Roberts  
Scott Sanderson  
Kansas Sartin  
David Schorlemer  
Mike Sharp  
David Singleton  
Chris Smisek  
Larry Stanley  
Frank Still  
Tim Strickland  
Bill Strieber  
R. Corey Survant  
Ryan Therrell  
Norman Trubee  
Peter Turnbull  
Ben Vaughan  
Forrest Vollentine  
Troy Williamson  
Barry Young

Executive Director, Robby Byers



CONSERVATION & PROTECTION OF MARINE LIFE

6919 Portwest Drive, Suite 100 | Houston, Texas 77024  
p 713.626.4222 | f 713.961.3801 | CCATexas.org

occasions, a bottle-nose dolphin's caudal fin will become entangled in the net while the dolphin is feeding on netted fish. These interactions are negligible and TPWD staff are quickly able to free the unharmed dolphin from the gill net.

TPWD has systematically collected fishery-independent and dependent data for the past 42 years, establishing the largest and longest running program of its kind in the nation. Data obtained from fishery-independent sampling (in this case gill nets) is critical in observing long-term trends, relative abundance and size of finfish and shellfish. We support TPWD's fishery-independent monitoring program, including the use of gill nets, and believe that the continued use of this sampling method is essential to providing fishery managers with the best available science.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on this application and we look forward to TPWD continuing its nationally recognized coastal fisheries monitoring program.

Sincerely,

Robby Byers

Executive Director

Coastal Conservation Association Texas